Development of the Stakeholder Marketing at the Enterprises in Transportation and Logistic System

The article deals with problems of stakeholder marketing development at the enterprises in transportation and logistic system in the cluster network. The conceptual model of the development is suggested on the basis of stakeholder marketing peculiarities analysis. Mechanism of realization considering perspectives to form transportation and logistic clusters in Ukraine is also proposed. Further areas for scientific studies on stakeholder marketing development are defined in the article.

Keywords: transportation and logistic service marketing, stakeholder marketing, stakeholder marketing development, stakeholder approach, transportation and logistic system enterprises, transport and logistic clusters.

Problem statement. Nowadays the scientific literature shows great interest to the marketing, which is beyond consumers as the only one centers to build interconnections, and focuses attention on all sides, interested in cooperation (stakeholder marketing). This marketing paradigm gives new opportunities for effective interrelation of all stakeholders to create joint valuables and to gain additional benefits.

The problem of stakeholder marketing development at the transportation and logistic system (TLS) enterprises in Ukraine is connected with necessity to pay wide attention to consumers’ needs satisfaction, because the interested parties influence the service providing efficiency in the transport and logistics sphere. It is especially seen in cluster organizations, where stakeholder networks cooperate between each other. Thus, the problem of stakeholder marketing development is urgent and perspective direction for scientific studies.

Analysis of the recent research and publications. The marketing new paradigm – stakeholder marketing, is based on stakeholder approach to manage the enterprise, basics of which have been established by Freeman [12]. Stakeholder marketing theory is shown in the works of such scientists as Bhattacharya & Korschun [1], Lawrence [9], Gundlach and Wilkie [5], Smith, Drumwright and Gentile [12], Frowand Payne [4], Hultetal [7], Luschand Webster [10], Laczińiak and Murphy [8], Ruiz-Roqueni and Retolaza [11], Deshpande [2], Hillebrand, Driessen and Koll [6] etc.

Unsolved questions, which are part of the general problem. However, scientific sources analysis showed that stakeholder marketing has not been formed into the finished theory yet. Its use at the various economic enterprises, including transport and logistic system in Ukraine, requires stakeholder marketing conceptual model formation, its realization mechanism, determination of the marketing tools using peculiarities and results estimation.
The object of an article is to form conceptual model of the stakeholder marketing development and its implementation mechanism at the enterprises in transportation and logistic system in cluster network.

Main material. Stakeholder marketing development at the enterprises of transport and logistic system is one of the perspective directions for marketing support of enterprises development and their competitiveness growth under modern conditions. It is of special value in cluster network, where cluster participants cooperate between each other. However, today the process of transportation and logistic clusters creation is developed slowly. Transport and logistic clusters creation was declared in Kherson, Odessa, Zakarpaya regions. But the irrele introduction keeps absence of necessary normative and legal base, unstable economic situation in the country, great risks in economic activity conduct, low level of trust to cooperation subjects – stakeholders, focus mostly on own interests. Thus, it hinders stakeholder marketing development, one of the principles of which is its cooperation, based on trust and consideration of all stakeholders’ interests.

The problem of stakeholder marketing introduction in Ukraine also includes in sufficient level of business culture, enterprises little knowledge of stakeholders’ theory, its advantages and implementation mechanism. In most cases, business structures, which have foreign origin, use stakeholder approach. Its elements are used also to solve concrete tasks in cooperation with stakeholders. However nowadays the reare no examples of the stakeholder marketing realuse in Ukraine.

In order to define attitude to stakeholder marketing and stakeholder approach in management, one carried out research among 20 the most representative enterprises, organizations of transport and logistics in Kharkiv region, where according to Sustainable development strategy transportation and logistic cluster is planned to be created till 2020. Small enterprises were not included to the selection, which have several workers and small number of service. The calculation of the selection size is confirmed by technique, shown in the work [14]. The selection size may be extended in further studies owing to including of enterprises, organizations from other regions into it, where transportation and logistic clusters will be created.

The research showed (table 1), about stakeholder marketing conception 100% of the enterprises from transport and logistic system do not have information and thus do not develop it, but among those enterprises 59% answered at they wished to understand and use stakeholder marketing. Unlike stakeholder marketing, stakeholder approach is partially used to solve some problems by 10% TLS enterprises (contacting with resources suppliers, enterprises-shippers of other transport types, involved in orders fulfillment for shipping etc) and 10% realize it, but do not use (their interests are connected with own benefits maximization).

However effective cooperation in cluster network requires its all subjects’ interests consideration to achieve general objective. That’s why, for stakeholder marketing successful introduction at TLS enterprises, which cooperate in cluster, it is necessary to develop the oretical grounds, models and algorithms of its introduction.

Let’s observe peculiarities of the stakeholder marketing development at the transportation and logistic system enterprises, which cooperate in cluster. They are based on the fact that enterprises, consumers, partners and other stakeholders are connected between each other with constant net. They have interests, interconnected with common goal – to satisfy consumers’ needs in transport and logistic service. The interests’ conflict, appearing in the process of TLS enterprises and stakeholders team-work, is solved through the dialogue. The base of the
интереси конфліктують з інтересами стейкхолдерів TLS-підприємств. Залишок інтересів вище ніж реальний результат надає транспортні і логістичні послуги, які видають для розподілу. Це здебільшого пов'язано з ціною політикою підприємства-перевізника, постачальників, партнерів з виконанням замовлень (підприємств з різних видів транспорту, логістичних підприємств, магазинів тощо).

Table 1 – Results of the enterprise research in transportation and logistic system in relation to stakeholder approach use in the management and stakeholder marketing conception in Ukraine (investigated by author)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Answers variants</th>
<th>Use of the stakeholders approach in TLS enterprises management TLS, %</th>
<th>Use of the stakeholder marketing conception by enterprises in TLS, %</th>
<th>Ratio between stakeholder marketing use and stakeholder approach, ±%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>They use in full</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>-10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>They use partially to solve some problems</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>-10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>They understand, but do not use</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>-10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>They wish to understand and to use</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>+14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>They have no idea, do not plan to use</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>–</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>They do not think about it</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>+6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Підприємства функціонують в складному системі, що включає взаємозв'язки між суб'єктами у скільку і зовні, залежно від формування довіри. Довіра надає нові можливості в взаємовідносинах, співпраці завдяки отриманню деяких переваг і кредиту довіри. Вона має велику цінність для формування довгострокових взаємодій між підприємствами TLS, споживачів і партнерів інших стейкхолдерів, через те, що транспорт з'єднує взаємодію суб'єктів. Її робота забезпечує ефективність, перспективність, ритмічність діяльності підприємств з різних економічних сфер, і також економічну ефективність в регіоні та країні у цілому. Все групи людей, які надають і отримують транспортні і логістичні послуги, беруть участь в створенні цінностей. Підприємства здійснюють демократичні маркетингові рішення, які керуються всіма стейкхолдерами.

Зберігаючи особливості стейкхолдерського маркетингу, розглянемо концептуальний моделі розвитку стейкхолдерства на підприємствах TLS в контексті ринку (рис. 1). Вона базується на цьох, що клієнти TLS-підприємств залучують різних стейкхолдерів.

Стейкхолдери – це всі ті суб'єкти, які спільну діяльність з підприємствами прямо або непрямо в процесі створення нових цінностей. Ми визначимо наступні з них:
– споживачі транспортних і логістичних послуг (фірми, організації, частні особи);
– інвестори, які фінансують клієнта TLS;
– банки, які є ринковим платником в клієнт TLS;
– будівельні організації, які надають інфраструктуру для транспортної діяльності;
– постачальники, які забезпечують матеріальні потoki;
– підприємства з наданням інтернет-послуг, які надають інформаційні потoki;
– підприємства з наданням технічного обслуговування транспорту;
– державні і регіональні органи, які мають регуляторні функції;
– рекрутингові агенції, які надають TLS-підприємствам необхідний персонал;
– освітні установи, які підтримують TLS-підприємства і новаторські інновації, дослідження;
– marketing mediators, who give marketing supply to develop enterprises, organizations of transport and logistic cluster, offering the service on marketing research, advertisements, public relations etc.

All listed enterprises, organizations and entrepreneurs are sides, interested in effective functioning of the cluster and its main objective achieving – to satisfy consumers’ demands. In their turn, consumers are main sides, interested in receiving of qualitative service by suitable price from enterprises and organization in cluster.

Figure 1 – Conceptual model of stakeholder marketing development (investigated by author)

One of factors, which reflect consumers’ interest level in cooperation with enterprise, is involvement. Vivek, Beatty, and Morgan [13] suppose that it shows intensity of consumers’ participation in the marketing proposals and actions, suggested by the enterprise, and is displayed in their cognitive, emotional, behavioral and social reactions.

State and regional authorities, interested in transportation and logistic cluster functioning increase, play an important role for stakeholder marketing development, because, owing to it,
new working place appear, budget receives extra incomes. Decisions, made by state and regional authorities, have to help to develop transport and logistic system and to show state support of the transportation and logistic cluster. Unfortunately, there is no full support of the territorial transport and logistic clusters development in Ukraine, but decisions concerning their organization, for example in Kharkiv region, are made by local authorities.

We will define such tasks to form transportation and logistic cluster, based on enterprises activity integrity, which provide combining of region, cluster, TLS enterprises and its stakeholders’ interests. They include: to put transportation and logistic service to the world market level and integration into the world transport system owing to defining and introducing of the TLS world tendencies development; to use geo-economic situation of the region to develop transport potential; to develop transportation and logistic service to the world market level and integration into the world transport system owing to defining and introducing of the TLS world tendencies development; to use geo-economic situation of the region to develop transport potential; to develop TL Sabilities for using in Ukrainian producers’ goods promotion and Ukrainian business positioning in European and world space; to reduce transportation expenses in gross domestic product, owing to which goods and service prime cost will be reduced; to develop container and intermodal transportations owing to some conditions creation; to increase gross income from transit and international traffics; to develop interconnection of the scientific and educational institutions with cluster core to introduce innovations, and to provide its enterprises and organizations with highly qualified staff; to increase efficiency of transport corridors, terminals, traffic infrastructure owing to innovations introduction and investments involvement; to create new competitive container and materials handling terminals, multimodal and transformational logistic centers; to introduce modern digital technology into transportation and logistic service providing process.

Introduction of the stakeholder marketing at the TLS enterprises requires formation of the system on interrelations with all stakeholders, based on general interests defining (Gf) and general purpose (GP), joint actions to achieve it (A):

\[ Gf \supseteq \left( IE \cap IS \right) ; \]
\[ A = AMS \cup AIS \cup ASI \cup ANP \cup ATM . \]  

It becomes possible owing to formation of the clear informational system, setting of effective communications, negotiations conduct, and stakeholders’ behavior motivating, and marketing actions joint control.

Stakeholders marketing introduction results (R) are general value creation by means of qualitative transport and logistic service, achieving of general and individual interests and problematic situations effective solving, benefits receiving by means of financial incomes and trusting interrelations setting in stakeholders network:

\[ R = RGP \cup RoP \cup RMR \cup RFI \cup RHC . \]  

These results will help to form positive image of both TLS enterprises and cluster at a whole, and its location region.

Under change ability, uncertainty, complexity and multiplicity conditions of the modern world stakeholder marketing development will provide increase of the TLS enterprises competitiveness. Competitiveness will depend on managerial processes efficiency, marketing actions and its participants’ ability effectively to use opportunities, given by cooperation in
cluster network, including sphere of resources, knowledge, management operability, marketing abilities:

\[ CL = f(A_i). \]  \hspace{1cm} (4)

Favorableness to innovations and business flexibility are widely developed in efficiently functioning cluster networks. Owing to these features, one can tell about enterprises capitalization growing, favorable investment climate formation.

Valuating of the stakeholder marketing development results \((V)\) at the transportation and logistic system enterprises requires qualitative and quantitative indexes. There are indexes, connected with enterprises objectives and its stakeholders. First of all it is level of cooperation satisfaction \((SL)\):

\[ SL \supseteq \left( RGP \cup RoP \right). \]  \hspace{1cm} (5)

Secondly, profitability level \((PL)\), which depends on all subjects’ cooperation efficiency in network:

\[ PL = f(ANP) \]  \hspace{1cm} (6)

Thirdly, trusting level increase \((TL)\) to the cooperation subjects, based on applications and real actions agreement:

\[ TL \supseteq \left( RMR \cup RFI \right). \]  \hspace{1cm} (7)

Fourthly, enterprise competitiveness level increase and all its stakeholders \((CL)\):

\[ V = SL \cup PL \cup TL \cup CL. \]  \hspace{1cm} (8)

Introduction of the stakeholder marketing development conceptual model at the enterprises of transportation and logistic system requires its realization effective mechanism. To start this model, three components of mechanism have to be considered. They are organizational mechanism, mechanism of marketing actions planning and realization and economic mechanism (Fig. 2).

Stakeholder marketing organizational mechanism can be realized owing to creation of cross-functional teams or marketing-center, which will implement stakeholder marketing, in transport and logistic cluster. Its creation will give opportunity to increase efficiency to control marketing activity at the cluster enterprises, flexibly to use staff, engaged in marketing activity, their knowledge and competences, to make workers self-perfected under conditions of team work, but sets great demands to personnel qualification, responsibility and communication skills.

Development of marketing-center personnel has to be oriented to form competences, all owing to adapt to changes, uncertainty, complexity and multiplicity of business run conditions and cooperation with interested parties in transport and logistic cluster. Personnel of the marketing-center must study effective interconnection, flexibility in marketing decisions making, trusting relations creation, develop empathy. It investigates procedures to coordinate stakeholders’ interests, forms informational system, plans and realizes marketing actions, controls process of its conduct and efficiency.
Mechanism of the stakeholder marketing realization

- **Organizational mechanism:** creation of structures or cross-functional teams, which realize stakeholder marketing, in transportation and logistic cluster.

- **Mechanism of actions planning and realization:** defining and coordinating of the participants’ interests of the transport and logistic process; setting of the dialogues with stakeholders to define tariff policy concerning transport and logistic operations; coordination of actions concerning marketing support of enterprises development in the cluster; control and estimation of the cooperation results.

- **Economic mechanism:** improvement of financial and economic factors at the TLS enterprises and stakeholders; increase of profits owing to cooperation subjects’ marketing actions coordination in the cluster network.

Figure 2 – Components of the stakeholder marketing realization mechanism (investigated by author)

Marketing-center, realizing mechanism to plan and implement marketing actions, has to work in the following way:

- to define stakeholders of the enterprises in transportation and logistic system in cluster creation and their main groups; to form profiles of the determined stakeholders, where to show stakeholders’ aims, their actions and possibilities of development, history of integrity and approaches to integrity, real or potential impact on the enterprise, risks and opportunities from cooperation, interests conflict and problems with enterprise and other stakeholders, interconnection perspectives etc. The main stakeholders in service providing process on transfer are: shipper; freighter; organization, which work out logistic transfers schemes; carriers (enterprises of different transport means); insuring companies, which in sure freight; customs (in case of international transfers), which conducts custom cargo execution; expeditionary organizations, which are responsible for cargo security; banks, serving financial calculations etc. Every stakeholder has his own interests and is oriented to get maximal benefit. Effectiveness of the consumers’ serving, his satisfaction depends on every cooperation subject. Problems with terms and tariff policy may be sources of interests conflicts;

- to define common marketing interests, objectives and problems, appearing in the integrity process. For example, in order to realize transport and logistic cluster integration strategy in the international network, the common interest, aim may be increase (receive) of the transportation and logistic service market part in some regions. This aim is agreed with stakeholders. It has special value in international multimodal and intermodal transfers, where several types of transport are engaged, and their organizer coordinates action of all interested sides, participating in transfer, at all stages of transferring process investigation and conduct: freight owners, carriers and carrying complexes in interests to fasten freight transfer and to reduce total expenses;

- to realize common aim, marketing-center carries out marketing research, results of which are brought to the stakeholders’ attention, forms clear informational system to coordinate stakeholders’ interests. The studies have to show peculiarities of the freight market by different transports, in various market segments, countries in the world; key factors, which are
necessary to achieve success at the market; problems, which may appear, including the legislative sphere while entering the international freight markets. The important field of the marketing research is transport and logistic service consumers’ behavior, changes in directions off reight transfer and priorities in transport choosing, freight market conjuncture analysis, external and internal space of the cluster etc.;

– to set effective dialogue, communications with stakeholders representatives to define common positions in relation to the marketing tools, which will be used at the new markets, and also role of every stakeholder in these tools implementation. It may concern the cooperative policy in the field of transportation and logistic cluster service promotion (common advertising and PR companies, loyalty programs); to form image of enterprises, organizations, included to the cluster network; to agree tariff policy; to develop digital methods of communication, supplying TLS enterprises sites with convenient functionality. It will help to follow freight transfer (tracking and tracing), to calculate transfers cost, to receive consultations at real time at all stages of transport and logistic service receiving etc;

– to carry out strategic and operative control of marketing acts realization and to give information to stakeholders to make decisions on correcting and developing of actions, that will provide all stakeholders’ interests consideration owing to compromise decisions making. It is possible due to defining of methods to give clear information in the stakeholders network, reporting forms, operative informing about changes in the process of transportation and logistic service providing, by TLS cluster participants;

– to evaluate results of the stakeholders marketing development, based on marketing studies, stakeholders’ inquiry, analysis of the interconnection results, general and individual objectives achieving. It can be represented by enterprise image improvement in the transportation and logistic cluster, in stable positive reputation development among consumers and trusting level in the stakeholders network.

Economic mechanism of the stakeholder marketing development in the transport and logistic cluster is realize doing to common work over effective using of resources, reducing of services prime cost, including due to transfers optimal routes determinations, optimization of storage expenses, introduction of marketing research results for consumers’ satisfaction and on this base development of the long-term relations; improving of financial and economic indexes, increasing of stakeholders’ profits. Coordination of the stakeholder marketing actions on the common aim achievement furthers synergetic effect in transport and logistic business profitability growing.

Conclusions. Thus, stakeholder marketing development at the enterprises of transportation and logistic system in cluster network is perspective direction, which will help to increase enterprises, cluster and its location region competitiveness. Under conditions of change ability, uncertainty, complexity and multiplicity in the modern world, new paradigm of the marketing provides business with flexibility, helps to form trusting relations, generates financial growing of all stakeholders. The suggested conceptual model of the stakeholder marketing development at the TLS enterprises in cluster network shows formation of common goal, based on common interests, actions for its achieving, results, received by the enterprise and stakeholders the basis of cooperation, and also results evaluation directions. The presented mechanism to realize stakeholder marketing, which includes three constituents – organizational mechanism, mechanism of marketing actions planning and realization and economic mechanism, will give opportunity for TLS enterprises effectively to cooperate with all stakeholders in cluster network.

Perspectives for further research in this area include formalization of the complex integrity between TLS enterprises and stakeholders in the cluster network and their interests agreement, defining of practical tools to use stakeholder marketing and to estimate its results,
and also to solve problems concerning structures creation, which will help to consider all stakeholders’ interests.


Н.В. Попова, канд. экон. наук, доцент, завідувач кафедри маркетингу, Харківський торгово-економічний інститут Київського національного торговельно-економічного університету (м. Харків, Україна);

В.Г. Шишканенко, д-р экон. наук, професор кафедри менеджменту, Харківський національний автомобільно-дорожній університет (м. Харків, Україна).

Розвиток маркетингу стейкхолдерів на підприємствах транспортно-логістичної системи

У статті розглядаються проблеми розвитку маркетингу стейкхолдерів на підприємствах транспортно-логістичної системи в кластерній мережі. На основі аналізу особливостей маркетингу стейкхолдерів запропонована концептуальна модель його розвитку, а також механізм реалізації з урахуванням перспектив формування транспортно-логістичних кластерів в Україні. Визначені подальші напрямки наукових досліджень відносно розвитку маркетингу стейкхолдерів.

Ключові слова: маркетинг транспортно-логістичних послуг, маркетинг стейкхолдерів, розвиток маркетингу стейкхолдерів, стейкхолдерський підхід, підприємства транспортно-логістичної системи, транспортно-логістичні кластери.

Н.В. Попова, канд. экон. наук, доцент, завідувач кафедри маркетингу, Харківський торгово-економічний інститут Київського національного торговельно-економічного університету (г. Харків, Україна);

В.Г. Шишканенко, д-р экон. наук, професор кафедри менеджменту, Харківський національний автомобільно-дорожній університет (г. Харків, Україна).

Розвиток маркетингу стейкхолдерів на підприємствах транспортно-логістичної системи

В статті розглядаються проблеми розвитку маркетингу стейкхолдерів на підприємствах транспортно-логістичної системи в кластерній мережі. На основі аналізу особливостей маркетингу стейкхолдерів запропонована концептуальна модель його розвитку, а також механізм реалізації з урахуванням перспектив формування транспортно-логістичних кластерів в Україні. Опреділені дільниці названі напрямки наукових досліджень відносно розвитку маркетингу стейкхолдерів.

Ключові слова: маркетинг транспортно-логістичних послуг, маркетинг стейкхолдерів, розвиток маркетингу стейкхолдерів, стейкхолдерський підхід, підприємства транспортно-логістичної системи, транспортно-логістичні кластери.